Recording Requested by:
City Clerk, Fresno, California
No Fee-Govt. Code 6103

Return to City Clerk, Fresno

Space above this line reserved for Fresno County Recorder's Office

RESOLUTION NO. 2009-225

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FRESNO, CALIFORNIA, DESIGNATING THE DEACON-EILERT HOME, LOCATED AT 660 E. CARMEN AVENUE, AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE TO THE LOCAL REGISTE OF HISTORIC RESOURCES

WHEREAS, the Deacon-Eilert Home was built in 1919 and was one of the early residences constructed in the 6-block Tower District neighborhood known as the "Wilson Island," and

WHEREAS, the 1½ story home was designed in a Tudor Revival style with Craftsman details and retains integrity to its period of significance of 1919-1945; and

WHEREAS, the home is associated with two distinguished Fresno families, Roual and Mae D. Deacon and William and Mae Eilert; and

WHEREAS, Roual Deacon owned the Lemoore Lumber Company and William Eilert founded the Fresno Brewing Company in 1900 with his father Ernst; and

WHEREAS, the owners of the property, William and Jeannine Raymond, support the designation of the building to Fresno's Local Official Register of Historic Resources; and

WHEREAS, the City of Fresno Historic Preservation Commission, at a duly noticed public hearing held on July 27, 2009, heard testimony on the subject property; and

WHEREAS, based on that testimony, and the presentation of facts relating to the criteria for official designation, as set forth in the Fresno Municipal Code, Chapter 12, Article 16, made the following findings;

> That the Deacon-Eilert Home meets the criteria set out in Article 16, Chapter 12, Section 12-1607 (a) of the Fresno Municipal Code; and is eligible for listing on Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources; and be recommended to the Fresno City Council for adoption as a Local Resource; and whereas in accordance with

Adopted 10/29/09
Approved 11/4/09
Effective 11/4/09

2009-225

Fresno Municipal Code, Article 16 Section 12-1601 et seq. this hearing has been duly noticed for Council action upon the designation recommended by the Commission; and

WHEREAS, on October 29, 2009, Council held a hearing where it considered the recommendation of the Historic Preservation Commission, and considered substantial evidence, including but not limited to, staff presentation, a report prepared by staff addressing the property's eligibility to the Local Register, a Primary Record ("PR") and a Building, Structure and Object Record ("BSOR") prepared by the City's Historic Preservation Specialist (as defined in FMC § 12-1604(b)) finding that the property met the Historic Resource eligibility requirements for criteria i and ii to subdivision 12-1607(a)(1).

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Fresno:

1. Council finds that the above recitals are true and correct.

2. Council finds that the Deacon-Eilert Home is eligible for listing under criteria i and ii of Fresno Municipal Code, subdivision 12-1607(a)(1) based upon the evidence presented to Council in the staff presentation, staff report, the PR and the BSOR.

3. Council designates the Deacon-Eilert Home as a Historic Resource to the Local Register of Historic Resources.

****

CLERK'S CERTIFICATION

STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
COUNTY OF FRESNO) ss.
CITY OF FRESNO)

I, REBECCA E. KLISCH, City Clerk of the City of Fresno, certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Council of the City of Fresno, at a regular meeting held on the day of October 29 , 2009.

AYES : Borgeas, Dages, Perea, Westerlund, Xiong, Sterling
NOES : None
ABSENT : None
ABSTAIN : None
RECUSED : Brand

Mayor Approval :	November 4	, 2009
Mayor Approval/No Return:	N/A	, 2009
Mayor Veto:	N/A	, 2009
Council Override Vote:	N/A	, 2009

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

JAMES C. SANCHEZ
CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE

BY: _____
Senior Deputy

DATE: 10/20/2009

REBECCA E. KLISCH

City Clerk

BY: _____
Deputy

State of California — The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

PRIMARY RECORD

Primary #
HRI #
Trinomial
NRHP Status Code
Other Listings
Review Code Reviewer Date

P1. Resource Name: [John B. Marshall Home]
***P2. Location: *a. County:** Fresno
***b. USGS 7.5' Quad**: Fresno South 1963, Photorevised 1981; Parcel located in the nw ¼ of Section 4 R 20E T14S
c. Address: 172 N. Echo Avenue, Fresno
d. Assessor's Parcel Number: 459-292-17

***P3a. Description:** A tiny one-story 4-room cottage is located on this parcel. Although described as an "ell" house in the 1990 evaluation by Karen Weitz Ph.D. the home clearly evolves from the 2-room side-gabled hall and parlor house of the British Isles (see BSO form). The wood frame building is now stucco clad. All windows are double hung wood sash with the exception of a casement window on the south elevation of the kitchen wing. The front door is offset and is solid wood, with the appearance of four vertical panels. There are two additions on the rear (East) elevation: one is apparently original and is a cross-gabled kitchen. A bathroom on the northeast corner fills out what is now a rectangular plan and has a shed roof. The interior of the home has been refurbished from its initial construction with cove ceilings and a Tudor arch opening between the "hall" (living room) and the back kitchen. The kitchen area has an interesting cove ceiling of tongue and groove.

The garage, as noted in the 1990 evaluation, is no longer extant. (For additional architectural description of the house please see attached AIE form by Weitz).

***P3b. Resource Attributes:** HP2 (Single family property, now vacant)
***P4. Resources Present:** ● Building ● Element of (Proposed) North Park Historic District

P5b Photo date: 11/04/04

***P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources:** c1884 (Weitz study of 1990). Stucco exterior and re-roof in 1938.

***P7. Owner and Address:**
Migran Kutnerian
103 N. Broadway
Fresno, 93701

***P8. Recorded by:** Karana Hattersley-Drayton, Historic Preservation Project Manager (and Karen Weitz Ph.D.)

***P9. Date Recorded:** 11/04/04; 11/06/1990

***P10. Survey Type:** Intensive

***P11. Report Citation: "Demolition Permit Review and Evaluation for Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources for 172 N. Echo Avenue."**

***Attachments:** ● Building, Structure and Object Report ● Continuation Sheet

*Recorded by: Karana Hattersley-Drayton *Date: 11/4/04 ■ Continuation

East (Rear) Elevation of 172 N. Echo Avenue

Streetscape, Looking South from 164 N. Echo

State of California — The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

Primary #
HRI#

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD

*NRHP Status Code:

***Resource Name: John B. Marshall Hall and Parlor House**

B3. Original Use: Single-family residence **B4. Present Use**: Sfr, now vacant

***B5. Architectural Style:** Hall and parlor, with additions

***B6. Construction History:** The cottage is located in Griffith's Second Addition which was platted in 1884 and annexed as a subdivision in 1899. The first empirical historic evidence for the home is the 1906 Sanborn Map. However, due to the house plan it would appear to date to the late 19th century. Karen Weitze in her 1990 survey for Caltrans estimated the construction date to be circa 1884.

***B7. Moved? ■ No**

***B8. Related Features:** The cottage is currently the last in a row of c1900 homes and cottages in the proposed North Park Historic District. A former garage is no longer on the property. Immediately east of the parcel across an alley is the Bethel Lutheran Church constructed in 1917 and designed by local architect Henry Starbuck. Immediately north of the parcel are two vacant lots and SR 180.

B9a. Architect: N/A **B9b. Builder**: N/A

***B10. Significance: Theme:** Early Settlement and Expansion **Area:** Griffith's Second Addition, Fresno
Period of Significance: c1884-1939 **Property Type:** Hall and Parlor House
Applicable Criteria: A, C, D

This small cottage is located in Griffith's Second Addition, an 1884 subdivision designed by John S. Eastwood, Fresno's first City Engineer (Powell 1994:13). Initially called "Wagner" the street name was changed to Echo Avenue sometime after the turn of the 20th century. The street is immediately adjacent to the 1910 Sunset Tract, an area heavily settled by Danish, Swedish and German families in the early 20th century (Weitze 1991:8). The First Swedish Lutheran Church was founded in 1914 at 112 Yosemite and Bethel Danish Lutheran Church designed by local architect Henry Starbuck was constructed in 1917, on the parcel immediately east of this home.

Lacking architectural style in the strictest sense, this home is nevertheless of extreme interest as an early example of pioneer/working class housing and of a property type, the hall and parlor house. The earliest hard evidence for a construction date (a terminus ante quem) is the 1906 Sanborn Map, which clearly shows the home without the later bathroom addition. The subdivision was annexed in 1899 and thus a year too late to be included in the 1898 Sanborn. However the house type places the construction date

***B12. References:** Building permits on file with the City of Fresno Planning and Development Department; 1906 and 1919 Sanborn Insurance Maps; Karen Weitze, Ph.D., "Historic Architectural Survey for a Proposed Freeway in the City of Fresno ... 06-25721, April 1991; Karana Hattersley-Drayton "Folk Housing in Pioneer California: A Preliminary Typology," Southwest Folklore 1980; Henry Glassie, Pattern in the Material Folk Culture of the Eastern United States 1968; Thomas Carter and Peter Goss, Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940, 1988; Cyrcil M. Harris, Dictionary of Architecture and Construction, 2000; Virginia and Lee McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 1994; Polk Directories; Powell "Supplementary Historic Building Survey", 1994; Polk Directories for Fresno 1911-1925.

***B14. Evaluator:** Karana Hattersley-Drayton
***Date of Evaluation: November 10, 2004**

(This space reserved for official comments.)

*Recorded by: Karana Hattersley-Drayton *Date: 11/04/04 ■ Continuation

to no later than 1900 and perhaps as early as 1884, when the subdivision was first platted.

The hall and parlor house is a 2-room side-gabled plan which originated in England and dates to the 17th century. In addition hall and parlor homes were built in Wales and Ireland. The façade is traditionally asymmetrical due to the fact that the two rooms are of unequal proportions. Traditionally the "hall" was a somewhat larger space and was used for cooking and "living." The parlor or best room was reserved for special occasions or perhaps served as the master bedroom. It was brought to Colonial New England and was built as well throughout the Tidewater South. Following development of the railroad, hall and parlor houses with light framed walls were the dominant folk house throughout the Southeast (Glassie 1968; Harris 2000:454; McAlester 1994:95). As settlers moved West they took their homes with them--- metaphorically speaking. Hall and parlor houses of wood, brick and stone were the "quintessential" house in Utah in the second half of the nineteenth century (Carter and Goss 1988:14). Closer to home, hall and parlor houses, usually with a back shed roof addition, were a standard house type in early California mining communities such as Bodie and the coal-mining town of Nortonville with its large Welsh population. In addition they were often constructed during the first generation of building in a new settlement (Hattersley-Drayton 1980:47-49; 1996:66).

Karen Weitze in her 1990 survey for the Fresno 180 Gap correctly noted the early construction date of this home, estimating it as circa 1884: "The cottage appears to have been constructed as soon as the streets were laid out and lots available for purchase" (Weitze 1990). If so, it would be the oldest residence in Fresno. She used as reference a 1886 dated photograph from P.F. Vandor's History of Fresno County vol. 1 which shows a hall and parlor home in the foreground (see attached). Weitze, incidentally referred to the property type as an "ell" house. In truth the home at least by 1906 was in the shape of an "L." But the side gabled two rooms, with porch and shed roof clearly mark this as a hall and parlor house, with additions.

Building permits were only instituted in Fresno in 1911 and there is no original building permit on record. In 1918, however, there was a permit for an alteration for $60. A safe guess is that this is when indoor plumbing was installed, and the bathroom on the northeast corner added. In 1938 the house was remodeled to include a stucco wrap exterior and new roof. The interior was probably upgraded as well at that time with cove ceilings, a new Tudor arch door between the living room and the kitchen. A brief inspection of the interior reveals that the work was of high quality, and the kitchen of particular interest. Although this was a very tiny house, it was a nice house. Erwin S. Martin did the 1938 work and was a neighbor who lived at 158 N. Echo.

Polk Directories can only be traced back to 1911 at which time a peddler, George B. Sanford lived in the home. The 1906 Sanborn Insurance Map indicates a chicken coop on the parcel (on the north boundary line) as well as a small outbuilding on the northeast corner at the alley. Other homes on the street incidentally had tankhouses in the back yard, and it is unknown how Mr. Sanford got his water, as no well is indicated. John B. Marshall, listed in the Polk Directories as both a carpenter and a rancher, lived in the house next door by 1914 (1913 Polk pages are missing). 172 N. Echo remained vacant for several years after Mr. Sanford moved on and was only habited again in 1921 by a Burton Johnston, investigator, and in 1925 by a Mrs. Anna Faulkner, who worked as a presser. By 1918 when the first recorded permit was issued for 172 N. Echo John B. Marshall was the owner, and he continued to own the property through at least 1938 when the renovation work was performed by his neighbor, Erwin Martin. It is thus appropriate to associate this property with Mr. Marshall, as the original owner and builder are unknown.

The John B. Marshall hall and parlor house appears to be eligible to the Local Register of Historic Resources under Criteria 1, 3 and 4. It is among the oldest and possibly the oldest standing home in this neighborhood and in all of Fresno and is an excellent example of working class housing (Criterion 1). It is also an exceedingly rare example in Fresno of the hall and parlor house, a type that goes back to 17th century England and which was brought west with the first wave of settlers (Criterion 3). And due to its early construction date, the home should be viewed as a potential for data recovery both archaeologically as well as architecturally (Criterion 4). Although it has lost some integrity due to the stucco wrap in 1938, the home maintains the essential profile and h-p plan as it was built in the late 19th century.

State of California — The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

PRIMARY RECORD

Primary #
HRI #
Trinomial
NRHP Status Code
Other Listings
Review Code Reviewer Date

P1. Resource Name: John B. Marshall Home
***P2. Location: *a. County:** Fresno
***b. USGS 7.5' Quad**: Fresno South 1963, Photorevised 1981; Parcel located in the nw ¼ of Section 4 R 20E T14S
c. Address: 164 N. Echo Avenue
d. Assessor's Parcel Number: 459-292-16
***P3a. Description:** There are two buildings on this parcel, a vacant single-family residence and a second home at the rear of the parcel which has been converted to storage.

Building 1: The cottage on the front of the parcel faces west onto North Echo Avenue and has an end-gable roof with a dual pitch or broken gable on the north elevation. The eaves are boxed. The home is wood frame construction with horizontal drop siding and sits on a brick foundation. Narrow wood siding at where the walls meet the foundation is lapped. A partial porch with shed roof extends across the façade and is supported by two square posts. The floor of the porch is cement over mortared uncut stone laid up in a random fashion. The back steps to the home are also supported by a foundation of mortared natural stone. All windows are currently boarded over but appear to be double hung sash. An addition on the rear (east) elevation has a shed roof.

Building 2: At the rear of the property, with access from the alley, is another early side-gabled home with a shed roof addition on the northern end. In plan it would appear that this was originally a hall and parlor home although of larger dimensions than the cottage next door at 172 N. Echo. The wood frame main building is clad in vertical siding with wide battens and sits on a brick foundation. A front porch area has been enclosed.

***P3b. Resource Attributes:** HP2 (Single-family residence, now vacant)
***P4. Resources Present:** ● Building ● Element of District

P5b Photo date: 11/4/04

***P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources:** c1908 (permit for addition in 1911)

***P7. Owner and Address:**
Migran Kutnerian
103 N. Broadway
Fresno, CA 93701

***P8. Recorded by:**
Karana Hattersley-Drayton
Historic Preservation Project Manager, City of Fresno

***P9. Date Recorded:**
November 4, 2004

***P10. Survey Type:**
Intensive

***P11. Report Citation: "Demolition Permit Review and Evaluation for Fresno's Local Register of Historic Resources for 164 N. Echo Avenue."**
***Attachments:** ● Building, Structure and Object Report ● Continuation Sheet

Resource: 164 N. Echo Avenue, Fresno

*Recorded by: Karana Hattersley-Drayton *Date: 11/4/04 ■ Continuation

Rear Elevation of 164 N. Echo and Back Unit on Property

State of California — The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

Primary #
HRI#

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD

*NRHP Status Code:

***Resource Name: John B. Marshall Home**

B3. Original Use: Single Family Residence **B4. Present Use:** Vacant

***B5. Architectural Style:** Vernacular gable-end cottage

***B6. Construction History:** The house on the front of the parcel was built between 1906 and 1911. It does not appear on the Sanborn Insurance Map of 1906 but a building permit for a "shed" alteration is granted to the owner, J.B. Marshall in 1911. Repairs were made in 1919 and an addition put on in 1935. Erwin S. Martin, who earlier lived next door, put on a front porch roof in 1938.

***B7. Moved?** ■ **No**

***B8. Related Features:** The cottage is currently the second to the last in a row of c1900 homes and cottages in the proposed North Park Historic District. A second house, long ago converted to storage and possibly parking is on the back of the lot with access from the alley. Immediately east of the parcel across the alley is the Bethel Lutheran Church constructed in 1917 and designed by local architect Henry Starbuck. North of the parcel is a c1884 cottage located at 172 N. Echo. State Route 180 cuts a swath through the neighborhood and is elevated at the northern truncated end of the block.

B9a. Architect: N/A **B9b. Builder:** Possibly John B. Marshall

***B10. Significance: Theme:** Early Settlement and Expansion, Working Class Neighborhood

Area: Griffith's Second Addition, Fresno **Period of Significance:** c1910

Property Type: Vernacular cottage **Applicable Criteria:** A

The two buildings on this parcel sit on lots 7 and 8 of Block 1 of Griffith's Second Addition, an 1884 subdivision designed by John S. Eastwood, Fresno's first City Engineer (Powell 1994:13). Initially called "Wagner" the street name was changed to Echo Avenue sometime after the turn of the 20th century. The street is immediately adjacent to the 1910 Sunset Tract, an area heavily settled by Danish, Swedish and German families in the early 20th century (Weitze 1991:8). The First Swedish Lutheran Church was founded in 1914 at 112 Yosemite and Bethel Danish Lutheran Church designed by local architect Henry Starbuck was constructed in 1917, on the parcel immediately east of this home.

The cottage on the front of the parcel is a relatively "new" home for the east side of this block. All of the other existing houses were constructed by 1906 (per the Sanborn Insurance Map) whereas this cottage appears to have been built by the owner, carpenter John B. Marshall circa 1910. In 1911 Mr. Marshall took out a permit for a shed and in 1919 and again in 1935 employed day labor to make repairs and put on an addition. Marshall is shown as living at 164 N. Echo from 1914 through 1921. By 1925 the front house was vacant. It is unclear when the building on the back of the parcel was constructed, but due to

***B12. References:** Building permits on file with the City of Fresno Planning and Development Department; 1906 and 1919 Sanborn Insurance Maps; Karen Weitze, Ph.D., "Historic Architectural Survey for a Proposed Freeway in the City of Fresno ... 06-25721, April 1991; Virginia and Lee McAlester, A Field Guide to American Houses, 1994; Polk Directories; Powell "Supplementary Historic Building Survey", 1994; Polk Directories for Fresno 1911-1925.

***B14. Evaluator:** Karana Hattersley-Drayton
Historic Preservation Project Manager

***Date of Evaluation: November 11, 2004**

(This space reserved for official comments.)

several facts it was clearly initially built to be a house, perhaps as a rental by the owner Mr. Marshall. The Polk Directory lists a Robert G. Hall also living at 164 N. Echo in 1917. Hall is listed as a carpenter. By 1919 both front and back cottages were vacant. Coincidentally that same year a permit was issued for "repairs" so it is not inconceivable that either there was a fire or some other reason that forced the residents to temporarily relocate. By the next year John Marshall was again shown as living in 164 Echo as was John Richardson. The rear home is noted as vacant. In 1921 the rear house was shared by James King, a gardener and by Cecil Waite, a chauffeur. Marshall lived alone in the front house. Both residences were shown as vacant in 1925, although Marshall continued to own the property at least through 1938 when he hired Erwin S. Martin to put a roof on the front porch.

The front gable end cottage has some architectural interest for the stone work at the front and back porches. The house is also a standard yet important vernacular house type used throughout early California. To date there is no information that establishes the owner and possible builder John B. Marshall as important in local and regional history. In fact it is his commonness that is of importance in understanding this working class neighborhood.

The home is nevertheless a contributor and critically so to this 19th, early 20th century streetscape. It is also a contributor to the proposed North Park Historic District. Like the domino effect, every home that is removed from the neighborhood cuts away at the percentages required to make this a historic district. Due to these factors the front cottage at 164 N. Echo appears to be eligible to the Local Register under Criteria 1 and 3. The home on the back of the property has been altered almost beyond recognition and appears to have sustained serious damage over the years. The rear building does not appear to be eligible for any historic listing under Fresno's Historic Preservation Ordinance nor is it a historic resource for the purposes of CEQA.

*Recorded by: Karana Hattersley-Drayton *Date: 10.15.09 ■ Update

Preparing to Move 172 N. Echo to Rear of Parcel at 164 N. Echo, May 27, 2009

Work Progresses on 164 N. Echo, October 2009

October 29, 2009

RECEIVED

2009 NOV -4 PM 1:41

CITY CLERK, FRESNO CA

Council Adoption: 10/29/09
Mayor Approval:
Mayor Veto:
Override Request:

TO: MAYOR ASHLEY SWEARENGIN

FROM: REBECCA E. KLISCH, CMC
City Clerk

SUBJECT: TRANSMITTAL OF COUNCIL ACTION FOR APPROVAL OR VETO

At the Council meeting of 10/29/09, Council adopted the attached Resolution No. 2009-225 entitled **Designating Deacon-Eilert Home, 641 E. Carmen, to Local Register of Historic Resources**, Item No. **10:15 A.M. 1**, by the following vote:

Ayes	:	Borgeas, Dages, Perea, Westerlund, Xiong, Sterling
Noes	:	None
Absent	:	None
Abstain	:	None
Recused	:	Brand

Please indicate either your formal approval or veto by completing the following sections and executing and dating your action. Please file the completed memo with the Clerk's office on or before November 9, 2009. In computing the ten day period required by Charter, the first day has been excluded and the tenth day has been included unless the 10th day is a Saturday, Sunday, or holiday, in which case it has also been excluded. Failure to file this memo with the Clerk's office within the required time limit shall constitute approval of the ordinance, resolution or action, and it shall take effect without the Mayor's signed approval.

Thank you.

****

APPROVED:

VETOED for the following reasons: (Written objections are required by Charter; attach additional sheets if necessary.)

Ashley Swearengin, Mayor

Date: 11-4-09

COUNCIL OVERRIDE ACTION:

Date: _____

Ayes	:
Noes	:
Absent	:
Abstain	: